Corporate Takeovers and Labor Restructuring

Discussion by:

Ashwini Agrawal

Paper Summary

 Research Problem: Empirically characterize labor restructuring that takes place around M&A events

- Empirical Approach:
 - Collect employer-employee matched data from Brazil
 - Measure changes in workforce characteristics at targets vs. control firms
- Findings:
 - Total employment and wage bill decreases
 - Increased layoffs, less hiring, more voluntary separations
 - Low skilled & routine task workers experience greatest displacement
 - Within-firm wage inequality increases
- Conclusion: Author claims evidence supports neoclassical efficiency-enhancing role of M&A

Assessment

Important topic and question

- Difficult to address: Data limitations
 - Detailed establishment-worker level data from Brazil

- Many interesting facts, but takeaway can be stronger with greater focus on fewer facts
 - Facts: employment changes, skill composition, wage inequality
 - Efficiency enhancing? No data on performance
- Suggestions:
 - Pick a more specific angle
 - Show facts in greater depth
 - Identify more meaningful change in priors

Picking a more specific angle

Currently, paper has large breadth of disparate facts (19 tables!)

- Total employment and wage bill decreases
- Increased layoffs, less hiring, more voluntary separations
- Low skilled & routine task workers experience greatest displacement
- Within-firm wage inequality increases

Suggestion:

Focus on a particular angle that is novel and capitalizes on strengths of data

Idea: Labor restructuring across M&A deal types (horizontal, vertical, diversifying)

- No evidence comparing labor restructuring across deal types
- Can export findings from Brazil to other settings
- Utilize skill data across deals

Picking a more specific angle

Currently, paper has large breadth of disparate facts (19 tables!)

- Total employment and wage bill decreases
- Increased layoffs, less hiring, more voluntary separations
- Low skilled & routine task workers experience greatest displacement
- Within-firm wage inequality increases (Ma et al. 2018)

Suggestion:

Focus on a particular angle that is novel and capitalizes on strengths of data

Idea: Labor restructuring across M&A deal types (horizontal, vertical, diversifying)

- No evidence comparing labor restructuring across deal types
- Can export findings from Brazil to other settings
- Utilize skill data across deals

Show facts in greater depth

Currently:

- Emphasis on 2 years pre- and post- merger changes at target: Shows diff-in-diff estimates only
- Lots of focus on identification

Hard to interpret diff-in-diff alone; usually ok if diff-in-diff provides a test of a specific hypothesis, but not for descriptive statistics

Suggestions:

If you focus on restructuring, then show restructuring in more depth

- 1. Show raw data in more detail (pictures!)
- 2. Instead of finding control firms for identification, explain what is happening at control firms? Why aren't some firms good targets?
- 3. What's happening at acquirer?
- 4. Not just routine task, but actual occupational changes?
- 5. Changes in task composition
- 6. Industry case studies?

Identify more meaningful takeaway

Currently: "Facts consistent with efficiency enhancing view"
Assume: Fewer workers/lower costs + revealed preference
-> efficiency has gone up

BUT, many believe most mergers "fail", no data on performance, many theories of –NPV mergers, and perhaps they are producing less with less

Suggestion:

Potentially evaluate theories in organizational economics
How are control rights changing? Changes in managerial
responsibilities around M&A? Use task-level data
How is information flow changing? Can extract data from O*NET
data on occupational codes
Worker tenure? Specific human capital?

Conclusion

Current Paper: Many disparate facts + soft takeaway about efficiency

- → Instead →
- 1. Choose a specific angle: workforce restructuring
- 2. Explore angle in more depth
- 3. Speak to deeper theoretical takeaways: learn about organizational economics of different types of M&A vis-avis labor restructuring

<u>Takeaway:</u> Can learn about how different types of corporate takeovers change the way the organization functions